

## **Interim Report May 2009 – August 2009**

### **Significant Accomplishments**

1. In May, External Advisory Board members Alice Hogan, Molly Carnes, Maria Zuber, Liz Bradley, and Britt Holmen came to campus to assess our progress on the grant to date. They were pleased with our overall program implementation, and significant data collection and analysis during the past year. The Board urged us to continue to better engage senior administrators and department chairs in institutional change efforts, and to utilize existing programs and literature from other ADVANCE institutions to inform our program development.
2. Tayhas Palmore (Professor of Engineering, and PI and Director of Brown's ADVANCE Program as of March 2009) designed a matrix and solicited participation from all parties to respond to the EAB's suggestions. The matrix engages ADVANCE staff members (Managing Director Susan Overton, Funding Resources Specialist Amy Robb, and Program Coordinator Krista Hedderich), Steering Committee members (four senior faculty members in the physical and biological sciences), and institutional partners (members of the Offices of the Provost, Dean of the Faculty, Dean of Medicine and Biological Sciences, and Vice President for Research) to implement, monitor, and "tweak" the programs and initiatives that support the four major components of our grant: Scientific Leadership Awards; Department Chair Training; Faculty Development/Mentoring Programs; and Visiting Scholars. This design ensures ongoing awareness and institutionalization of ADVANCE programs at senior levels of administration.
3. We offered two literature review sessions to familiarize ourselves further with the social science research, which serves as a foundation for ADVANCE programs. We invited institutional partners to participate in these discussions with us, and were joined by the Deputy Provost, Associate Provost for Institutional Diversity, five Associate Deans of the Faculty and BioMed, and the Vice President for Research. These meetings were very fruitful: this group of administrators and colleagues (who are rarely in the same room together) were able to discuss and consider changes to Brown's tenure and promotion policies and practices in light of gender equity issues and national "best practices."

Literature and discussions covered the 1999 MIT Report; gender bias in letters of recommendation; the influence of unintentional bias in judging academic merit; Dr. Mary Ann Mason's work on the impact of family care giving responsibilities on women faculty; and constructed criteria (based on gender stereotypes) that influence evaluation processes. These discussions indicated a need to utilize social science research and ADVANCE literature to supplement training for Brown faculty search committees, department chairs, and the Tenure, Promotions, and Appointments Committee (TPAC). To that end, ADVANCE staff and Steering Committee members are working with the Associate Provost and Associate Deans to develop training materials for department chairs (ADVANCE's "Increasing the Retention and Advancement of Women and Minority Scientists: A Guide for Department Chairs" was distributed at the Fall 2009 Chairs' Orientation); faculty search committee diversity officers (a training tool that summarizes relevant gender bias literature and provides national data to benchmark the percentages of women and faculty of color in Brown's candidate pools); and an annotated bibliography of gender bias literature to be posted on the websites of the Deans of the Faculty and BioMed; TPAC; and ADVANCE.

4. This summer, the ADVANCE Midcareer Peer Mentoring Group continued its monthly meetings. This group of eight associate and full women professors in the sciences has formed a loyal network. They spend their meeting times in good discussion to problem solve around ethical disagreements with colleagues; negotiating with department chairs; grant submissions; professional association presentations and responsibilities; utilizing University policies without incurring professional penalties; and work/family balance.
5. We have contracted with Kerry Herman, Assistant Director of the Global Research Group at the Harvard Business School to work with us to develop case studies based on Brown women faculty members' experiences for use in Spring 2010 department chair training sessions. Case studies have been used with great success at other ADVANCE institutions (U of Wisconsin, Iowa State) to "localize" gender equity issues, and increase chairs' understanding and discussion of institutional and departmental climates. Dr. Herman has met with two groups of women faculty, and will begin individual interviews with women faculty and department chairs to develop a specific case study scenario. We will identify and train ADVANCE Steering Committee members and other senior faculty to lead case study discussions with department chairs.

6. Events and outreach for Fall 2009 include:

- Monthly Faculty Outreach and Networking Events (FONE), which bring together administrators, faculty, and staff to hear brief presentation on one of a range of faculty development topics followed by an opportunity to network with Brown colleagues.
- Brown bag lunches at the end of September with new faculty in the physical sciences to discuss early investigator opportunities and university resources for external funding support, co-sponsored by Corporate and Foundation Relations.
- Visiting Scholar Nancy Hopkins' public lecture on October 21 entitled, "Mirages of Equality: Progress of Women in Science at MIT, 1971-2009" followed by sessions with ADVANCE constituents.
- A public lecture on October 27 by consultant Dr. Donna Dean of Lewis-Burke Associates, entitled "Building Connections With NIH Program Officers: Myths and Realities," followed by a luncheon with women scientists.
- Collaborating with University Library in the development of a research guide on grants and grant writing.
- September presentations on the status of women faculty in the sciences and ADVANCE at Brown initiatives for New Faculty Orientation and New Department Chair Orientation, both sponsored by the Office of the Dean of the Faculty.
- Soliciting a more diverse group of senior faculty members to serve as Mentors in the cross-departmental Faculty Mentoring Program via targeted email invitations from ADVANCE Steering Committee member/Professor of Geological Sciences Karen Fischer.
- ADVANCE Department Chair Sessions on "Recognizing Gender Bias in Letters of Recommendation," "The Department Chair's Role in Institutional Change: Lessons from MIT," and "Faculty and Families: Negotiating Dual Career Hires and Caretaking Leaves."
- Preparations for our NSF Third Year Site Visit in mid-November.

**Areas of Difficulty/Resistance**

We continue to grapple with ways to interest, support, and promote women scientists in departmental and institutional leadership positions at Brown. Our External Evaluator's survey

and focus group results indicate a lack of interest in University administration among female and male faculty members. Dr. Billson summarized women faculty members' responses to the Administrator Shadowing Program by saying:

The bottom line is that administrative work is not highly valued for scientists-- they define it as an "exit" out of scholarly and research productivity and a dead end for them in the long run. It is not rewarded enough. We've heard this before--if the women engage in administrative, advising, or departmental logistics, they fall behind in their research.

We are working to develop two awards in response to this feedback from women faculty and needs for departmental leadership as articulated by several STEM department chairs. A stepping stone to the position of Department Chair is often leadership of a major departmental committee by tenured faculty members; we are exploring the possibility of funding teaching relief or providing recognition and gender equity training for female and male faculty members who serve in these capacities. In addition, we are designing ADVANCE Departmental Lecture Series Awards that will provide travel funds for visiting women faculty and faculty of color who present lectures for STEM departments' colloquia; this will increase the visibility of women and people of color as scientists/researchers/role models at the departmental level, and may help to recruit more females and faculty of color to Brown.

### **Best Idea/Insight Yet**

The ADVANCE Literature Review sessions (see #3 above) have created a greater sense of team and camaraderie among ADVANCE staff and Steering Committee members and our institutional partners than we could have anticipated. We have found new common ground in discussion topics and ways to collaborate, as well as an engaging model for department chair training.

### **Project Evaluation Update**

1. Our External Evaluator's (Dr. Janet Billson) "pre-test" survey results were reported during the spring of 2009. The results indicate great differences in perceptions and experiences among male and female faculty members at Brown. Women faculty are significantly less likely than male faculty members to perceive that there are equitable opportunities for advancement and fair treatment in the tenure and promotion process. In addition, women in the School of Medicine and Biological Sciences are significantly less satisfied with

departmental and institutional climates than their male colleagues in BioMed and their male and female colleagues in the Faculty of Arts and Sciences. These survey results have been shared with all STEM department chairs, deans, and women faculty. They will be used in relevant department chair training sessions. (Report attached.)

2. In May 2009, Dr. Billson and her colleagues conducted three focus group sessions to assess the impact of ADVANCE at Brown thus far: two groups were made up of STEM women faculty members who had participated in ADVANCE Programs, and the third group was a comparison group of women faculty from the Social Sciences. We are awaiting full results from this research, but as mentioned above in “Areas of Difficulty,” we have used findings from these focus groups to better understand the lack of response to two of our Leadership Awards (Administrator Shadowing and Leadership Support).