Anatomical enablers and the evolution of C₄ photosynthesis in grasses

Pascal-Antoine Christin, Colin P. Osborne, David S. Chatellet, J. Travis Columbus, Guillaume Besnard, Trevor R. Hodkinson, Laura M. Garrison, Maria S. Vorontsova, and Erika J. Edwards

The PACMAD clade, whereas the similarly sized BEP clade contains plants. However, C₄ origins are absent from most plant lineages were probably facilitated by the existence in most C₃ plants of sugars (4, 5). In the so-called C₄ photosynthetic pathway, this decline of atmospheric CO₂ levels around 30 million years ago known. Climate changes during the Cenozoic included a marked dictating differences in evolvability among groups are often un-

The evolvability of some traits can influence the capacity of organisms to adapt to environmental changes, but the factors dictating differences in evolvability among groups are often unknown. Climate changes during the Cenozoic included a marked decline of atmospheric CO₂ levels around 30 million years ago (1, 2), which lowered the efficiency of photosynthesis in plants (3). Several lineages of flowering plants adapted to the resulting CO₂ depletion, particularly in warm, open, and/or dry conditions, by evolving mechanisms that concentrate CO₂ around chloroplasts, where the Calvin cycle uses CO₂ and energy to produce sugars (4, 5). In the so-called C₄ photosynthetic pathway, this increase in internal CO₂ concentration results from a spatial segregation of carbon assimilation and reduction (3). The vast majority of C₄ plants use a dual-cell system, where the assimilation of CO₂ into organic compounds occurs in mesophyll (M) cells of the leaf, whereas carbon reduction by the Calvin cycle, which occurred in the M cells in their C₃ ancestors, happens in the vascular bundle sheath (BS).

The C₄ pathway requires both a specialized foliar anatomy and the addition of a complex biochemical pathway that assimilates and delivers carbon to the Calvin cycle (3). Despite this complexity, it evolved more than 62 times independently in distantly related groups of flowering plants (5). These recurrent C₄ origins were probably facilitated by the existence in most C₃ plants of metabolic modules that are suitable for the C₄ pathway and can be recruited for this function through relatively few mutations (6, 7). In addition, the photosynthetic pump based on glycine decarboxylase is a likely evolutionary stable intermediate phenotype on the road from C₃ to C₄ (3, 8). However, C₄ origins are not randomly distributed across the plant tree of life; although most large (species rich) clades of plants completely lack C₄ taxa, others contain an astonishingly high number of C₃-to-C₄ transitions (5). This is particularly the case with grasses, in which C₄ photosynthesis evolved independently 22–24 times (9). Most grass species belong to either the BEP or PACMAD clade, which contain approximately the same number of species (ca. 5,423 and 5,706, respectively); however, the repeated C₄ origins occurred only in the PACMAD clade (9).

The homoplasic tendency of some groups, manifested in the extreme clustering of C₄ origins, suggests that several plant lineages possess traits that increase C₄ evolvability (10, 11). Such enablers may include ecological factors, as well as genomic and anatomical properties (10). For optimal functioning of the C₄ pathway, foliar anatomy must be altered to increase the relative proportion of BS cells and reduce the average path length between M and BS cells (12–15). These modifications guarantee an efficient centripetal increase of CO₂ concentration, but they also imply that C₄ evolution involved many mutations, unless the C₃ ancestors already possessed some C₄-like anatomical characters. Putative C₄ preadaptations have been detected in C₃ taxa closely related to C₄ species in small groups of eudicots with a limited number of C₃ origins (16–19). Recently, a preliminary survey of the proportion of BS tissue and the interveinal distance (IVD) in different C₃ and C₄ grasses suggested that a larger proportion of BS tissue characterizes the C₃ PACMAD, which are closer to C₄ values (20). The same study concluded that short IVD evolved later and was not an important determinant of C₄ evolvability (20). In this work, the different traits that, together, determine the amount of BS tissue or the IVD (e.g., number and size of different types of cells) were not measured separately. The species sampling did not include species outside the BEP and PACMAD clades, preventing any inference about the
directionality of trait evolution. In addition, the analyses did not use phylogenetic comparative methods, precluding a formal statistical evaluation of the link between foliar characteristics and C_{4} evolution.

In the present work, we measured anatomical traits in 157 grasses representing the BEP and PACMAD clades and several outgroups, as well as the diversity of photosynthetic types known within the group. A phylogenetic framework was used to test statistically for the presence of C_{4} precursors and to locate them on the phylogeny, and the evolution of foliar traits was modeled in a phylogenetic context to (i) reconstruct the leaf modifications that occurred during the transition from C_{3} to C_{4} photosynthesis and (ii) identify the leaf traits that might explain the propensity of some grass lineages to evolve C_{4} photosynthesis.

**Results**

**Phylogenetic Patterns.** A total of 172 cross-sections were measured, representing 157 species. Six of these represent outgroup taxa (either grasses sister to the BEP-PACMAD clade or members of families affiliated with grasses), 37 C_{3} BEP, 62 C_{3} PACMAD, and 52 C_{4} PACMAD. The two BS layers that characterize all C_{3} and many C_{4} grasses (outer sheath [OS] and inner sheath [IS]) were measured separately (Fig. S1). Of the C_{4} taxa, 26 use the OS for carbon reduction (C_{4}-OS) and 26 use the IS (C_{4}-IS). Only five of the C_{4}-IS species also possessed an OS layer. A total of 17 C_{4} lineages were sampled out of 22-24 described previously (9). This included five C_{4}-OS lineages, nine C_{4}-IS, and three that contained both C_{4}-IS and C_{4}-OS (Fig. 1). The five C_{4} lineages not sampled in this study all belong to Paspalaceae and are species-poor groups, putatively using a C_{4}-IS pathway (21, 22).

The model of C_{4} evolution that assumed the existence of precursors (precursor_2) was significantly better than the binary model [Akaiake information criterion (AIC), 135.5; AIC difference of 4.7] but only slightly better than the model with equal rates of transition from C_{3} to precursor and from precursor to C_{4} (precursor_1; difference of AIC, 0.4). In the precursor_2 model, the rate of C_{3}-to-precursor transition was estimated to be 0.005, and the rate of precursor-to-C_{4} transition was estimated to be 0.016, which suggests that some characteristics evolved a small number of times and favored the subsequent repeated origins of C_{4} photosynthesis (Fig. 1). A single origin of the precursor was inferred along the branch leading to the PACMAD clade (probability of precursor at the stem, 0.05; at the crown, 1.0) and was followed by multiple transitions to C_{4}.

**Description of Variables.** The individual anatomical traits values all overlapped between C_{3} and C_{4} taxa, but C_{4}-OS had higher proportions of OS tissue [%OS = OS area/(OS area + M area)] and C_{4}-IS higher proportions of IS tissue [%IS = IS area/(IS area + M area)] (Fig. 2). The larger %IS and %OS values result mainly from a decreased amount of M tissue per vein in both C_{4}-OS and C_{4}-IS compared with C_{3} taxa, which is the consequence of a reduction in BS distance (BSD). The area values of OS tissue per vein and the width of OS cells largely overlapped between C_{4}-OS species and C_{3} taxa. By contrast, the area of IS tissue per vein tends to be larger in C_{4}-IS than in C_{4}-OS and C_{3} taxa and this is attributable mainly to an increase of the width of IS cells in C_{3}-IS. The other variables are not consistently different between C_{3} and C_{4} taxa (Fig. S2).

The C_{3} BEP and C_{3} PACMAD do not differ in amount of M tissue per vein, which is reduced compared with the outgroups (Fig. 2). However, C_{4} PACMAD have greater areas of OS tissue per vein compared with C_{3} BEP, which is attributable to larger OS cells. For these two traits, C_{3} PACMAD do not differ from C_{4}-OS species. This results in %OS values in C_{4} PACMAD that are intermediate between C_{3} BEP and C_{4}-OS (Fig. 2). The C_{3} BEP show smaller IS and OS sizes and, consequently, lower areas of OS and IS per vein compared with the outgroups (Fig. 2).

**Comparative Analyses.** The evolutionary dynamics of several characters were best explained by a stabilizing selection [Ornstein–Uhlenbeck (OU)] model with a single optimum when considering C_{3} taxa only (Table 1). However, M area per vein and BSD evolved around different optima (OU models) in the outgroups compared with the BEP-PACMAD clade (Table 1). Similarly, the optima of OS area per vein, OS width and IS width were reduced in BEP compared with both the C_{3} PACMAD and outgroups, and the optima of %OS and leaf thickness were increased in C_{4} PACMAD relative to both the BEP clade and the outgroups, whereas the optimum of the ratio of thicknesses was decreased (Table 1). Within PACMAD, the mean vein area was best modeled by an OU model with a single optimum (Table 1). The optima of M area per vein and leaf thickness were decreased in C_{4} (both C_{4}-IS and C_{4}-OS) compared with C_{3} PACMAD. C_{4}-IS had a lower optimum for OS per vein and OS width but a higher optimum for IS per vein and IS width. Finally, %IS, %OS, and BSD were best modeled with one optimum per photosynthetic type (Table 1).

**Ancestral Reconstructions.** The ancestral reconstructions indicate that a higher %OS evolved at the base of the PACMAD clade, as hypothesized previously (20), and was maintained with further increases in multiple clades that led to the emergence of C_{4}-like
%OS was in several parts of the phylogeny (Fig. 3). This increase of %OS was attributable to an increase of OS cell size, which is especially large in several PACMAD lineages, whereas in the BEP clade, the Bambusoideae and Pooideae lineages are generally characterized by very small OS cells (Fig. S3). By contrast, %IS shows smaller differences between BEP and C₄ PACMAD lineages, and C₃-like values evolved only a small number of times: three in the PACMAD and one in the BEP (Fig. S4). However, larger IS cells are more frequent in PACMAD; in BEP, they occurred only in one species (*Lygeum spartum*; Fig. S5). Small BSD values characterize the whole BEP-PACMAD clade, but large values appeared repeatedly within both BEP and PACMAD (Fig. S6).

The inferred transitions between C₃ and C₄-OS involved on average a 1.8-fold increase of %OS (Fig. 4). This was attributable to a strong decrease in the amount of M per vein (except in *Alloteropsis*), which was driven by a strong reduction in BSD. The size of OS cells and, consequently, the amount of OS tissue per vein were not significantly increased, except in the transition that gave rise to the C₄-OS *Alloteropsis*. The evolution of a C₄-OS type from C₃ ancestors required more dramatic changes, with, on average, a 4.0-fold increase in %IS. This resulted from a large reduction of BSD, which strongly reduced the amount of M per vein and, in most cases, an increase of IS width and consequently IS area per vein.

**Modeling of Anatomical Enablers.** The model that assumed an increase of the probability of being sister to a C₄-OS lineage above a given %OS ratio was significantly better than the null model ($\chi^2 = 12.8; df = 1; P < 0.001$). The optimal threshold for a shift of transition rates was 0.15, which appeared at the base of the PACMAD clade and in some BEP (Fig. 3). Above this value, the rate of transition to C₄-OS was 0.010. The evolvability of C₄-OS was also adequately explained by the size of OS cells alone ($\chi^2 = 5.3$; Table 1).

### Table 1. Modeling of evolution among taxonomic groups and photosynthetic types

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Trait</th>
<th>C₃ only</th>
<th>PACMAD only (C₃ and C₄)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>%OS</td>
<td>OU2</td>
<td>P</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>%IS</td>
<td>OU</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M per vein</td>
<td>OU2</td>
<td>Out [B+P]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BSD</td>
<td>OU2</td>
<td>Out [B+P]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OS per vein</td>
<td>OU2</td>
<td>B [out+P]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IS per vein</td>
<td>OU</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IS width</td>
<td>OU2</td>
<td>B [out+P]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean vein area</td>
<td>OU</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leaf thickness</td>
<td>OU2</td>
<td>P [out+B]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ratio of thicknesses</td>
<td>OU2</td>
<td>P [out+B]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

B, BEP; C₃, C₄, PACMAD; IS, C₃-IS; OS, C₃-OS; OU2, OU with different optima for two groups; OU3, OU with different optima for three groups; out, outgroups; P, PACMAD.

*Best model determined by likelihood ratio tests and Akaike information criteria.

Groups with significantly different optima. Dashes indicate that a single optimum is favored.
df = 1; $P = 0.021$), with an OS width above 15.7 leading to a transition rate of 0.005. Finally, BSD also explained the evolvability of C$_4$-OS ($\chi^2 = 6.4; \text{df} = 1; P = 0.012$), with a BSD below 196 leading to a rate of transition of 0.006. Similarly, the evolvability of C$_3$-IS was explained by %IS, IS width, and BSD ($\chi^2 = 5.1, \chi^2 = 5.9,$ and $\chi^2 = 4.1,$ respectively; $\text{df} = 1; P = 0.022,$ $P = 0.015,$ and $P = 0.042,$ respectively), with a %IS above 0.003, an IS width above 6.2, and a BSD below 233 leading to a rate of transition of 0.005.

**Discussion**

**Anatomical Factors Increase C$_4$ Evolvability in PACMAD.** Variation in the evolvability of the C$_4$-OS type among clades of Poaceae and affiliated taxa is well explained by differences in %OS. Higher %OS in C$_3$ plants apparently facilitates the evolution of C$_4$ photosynthesis by reducing the distance between the C$_3$ and C$_4$ phenotypes but also potentially by giving access to transitional stages with a selective advantage over the C$_3$ condition. The exact evolutionary path between C$_3$ photosynthesis and the C$_4$-associated biochemistry is not resolved with confidence, but the photorespiratory pump based on glycine decarboxylase is often seen as an intermediate stage between C$_3$ and C$_4$ photosynthesis (3, 8, 18). Abundant OS tissue is instrumental in allowing its evolution because it implies that a decrease of glycine decarboxylase in M cells will not be detrimental, as enough of the enzyme will still be expressed in OS cells (3). Once a photorespiratory pump is fixed by natural selection, the biochemical components of the C$_4$ pathway can be gradually acquired and optimized until a highly efficient C$_4$ trait emerges. All enzymes of the C$_4$ pathway already exist in C$_3$ plants, and C$_4$ compatible promoter sequences are widespread in angiosperms (6, 7). The evolution of the C$_4$ trait can consequently require relatively few mutations in plants with a suitable leaf anatomy, which, in grasses, largely includes members of the PACMAD clade (Fig. 3).

The %OS is itself a complex trait, which results from variation in the number and size of cells of different tissues. The main determinants of %OS are BSD and OS width, and both partially explain the evolvability of C$_4$-OS. A small BSD evolved at the base of the BEP-PACMAD clade, and despite important variation in both clades, it still characterizes most extant members of
these groups (Fig. S6). This decrease of BSD occurred through a reduction of the number of M cells between OSs without a significant change in the size of these cells (Fig. S7). A small BSD is, however, not sufficient to confer large %OS, which also requires large OS cells. Enlarged OS cells are inferred for the deepest nodes in our phylogeny, which suggests that the ancestor of grasses possessed OS cells that were compatible with C4 anatomy (Fig. S3). A reduction of OS width occurred in most of the lineages of the BEP clade, with even the partial degradation of OS in several Pooideae. The independent changes in BSD and OS width led to the restriction of large %OS to PACMAD, contributing to the recurrent C4-OS origins in this clade millions of years later.

**Transitions to C4 Anatomy Involved a Further Reduction of BSD.** Compared with C3 plants, C4-OS species are characterized by higher %OS, which can be achieved through a decrease of M area or an increase of OS area. A decrease of M area must involve a reduction in the number and/or size of M cells, whereas an increase of OS area must occur through an enlargement of OS cells. In plants, the majority of changes in organ size are attributable to mutations in the control of cell proliferation (23), which suggests that mutations affecting the number of cells are more frequent than those affecting their size. Congruently, in all C4-OS, a smaller BSD was achieved by a reduction in the average distance between veins present in the C3 ancestor through a reduction of the number of M cells between veins (Fig. S7). This indicates that the capacity to rapidly reduce BSD is instrumental in the evolution of a C4-suited foliar anatomy. The relatively high lability of this trait guarantees a recurrent emergence of lower BSD and a fertile ground for natural selection. In contrast, the width of OS cell was not consistently affected during the transition from C3 to C4-OS, and the selective optima for this trait are not different in C3 and C4-OS taxa (Table 1). Cell-size variation among plant species is generally a function of genome size (24) and an increased size of a given type of cell is often achieved through the postmitotic duplication of the plant’s genome (25). Mutations drastically affecting OS width are, thus, probably infrequent, which limits the capacity of natural selection to fix larger OS cells.

**Case of C4-IS.** The evolvability of the C4-IS type is increased in groups with enlarged IS cells and shorter BSD. Compared with C3-OS, the C4-IS phenotype is more distant from the C3 ancestral condition, and C4-like values of %IS are extremely rare in both BEP and PACMAD. The only C4-IS lineage outside Panicoideae (Aristida spp.) evolved from a group with a C4-like %IS (Fig S4), and the independent C4-IS lineages of Panicoideae all reduced their BSD through the addition of minor veins between the veins present in the C3 ancestor (Fig. S7) (21), mirroring the evolution of C4 anatomy in the Flaveria (Asteraceae) (26). These minor veins are composed almost exclusively of BS tissue and some species even evolved BS-like cells that punctuate the M without being associated with any vein (21, 27, 28). Their addition resulted in a very dramatic increase of %IS and likely strongly contributed to the recurrent C4 origins in Panicoideae. However, these additional veins per se did not generate the high %IS values observed in extant taxa, which were possible only through a further increase of IS width.

C4-IS evolution would have involved fewer changes if it happened from a C4-OS instead of a C3 ancestor. In some groups, the transition seems to have occurred directly from C3 to C4-IS [e.g., Neurachninae (29)], but a C3 to C4-OS transition followed by a change to C4-IS must have occurred at least once in the MCP clade, which contains a C4-IS group (Cenchrinae) nested within an otherwise C4-OS clade (Melinidinae and Panicinae; Fig. 1) and possibly also in Alloteropsis (11). In addition, the C3 Homolepis spp. have enlarged OS, filled with centripetal chloroplasts (Fig. S8). Whether these are involved in some kind of photorespiratory pump is unknown, but Homolepis is closely related to several C4-IS taxa, some of which still produce starch in OS cells (9, 21), which might suggest that this C3 group with a C4-OS like anatomy is similar to the ancestor that produced C4-IS descendants. The transition from C3 to C4-OS results in an increase of %IS because the decrease of BSD during C4-OS evolution reduces the M area per vein but also because the enlargement of OS cells is associated with increased IS cell size.

---

**Fig. 4.** Changes of anatomical traits inferred during C4 evolution. The inferred change in five important traits is indicated for all C3 to C4-OS and all C3 to C4-IS (in blue) transitions. Each line connects the values of the most recent C3 ancestor (on the left) and the first C4 descendant (on the right). The asterisks indicate changes that led to the Alloteropsis cimicina lineage.
(phylogenetic linear model; $R^2 = 0.30$), possibly because the two traits share some genetic determinism. Together with the capacity of Poaceae to produce additional veins, a passage through C3-Os might consequently have strongly facilitated the evolution of the C4-IS type.

**Conclusions**

Identifying the determinants of relative evolvability among clades is key to understanding the drivers of biological diversification. Most flowering plants possess metabolic modules suitable for C4 photosynthesis, and yet C4 origins are tightly clustered only in a handful of lineages. Here, we provide comparative statistical evidence that C4 evolvability is determined, in large part, by leaf anatomy. Both OS and IS cell sizes determine the probability of transition to C4-Os and C4-IS, respectively, with an additional effect of BSD. Previous work has suggested that C4-like anatomy evolved in PACMAD through adaptation to specific environments (20), but our comparative analyses, instead, emphasize the importance of stochastic historical processes. A reduction of BSD happened at the base of the BEP-PACMAD clade, leading to the coexistence of shorter BSD and large IS and OS cells in the common ancestor of the BEP and PACMAD clades. The foliar anatomy of this common ancestor might, thus, have been compatible with C4 photosynthesis, but the atmospheric CO$_2$ levels at this time were high, limiting the advantage of C4 photosynthesis. Subsequently, OS and IS cells became smaller in most BEP, possibly through selection, and this apparently suppressed the capacity of these plants to later evolve C4 photosynthesis. When atmospheric CO$_2$ decreased tens of millions of years after the split of the BEP and PACMAD clades (2, 30–32), a combination of shorter BSD and large OS/IS cells existed only in members of the early PACMAD clade, limiting C4 evolution to this lineage. Changes in the number and size of different cells during the early change of history might have had limited importance at the time but allowed photosynthetic diversification when environmental changes opened new ecological niches during the Oligocene, highlighting the importance of historical contingency in evolutionary and ecological adaptation.

**Materials and Methods**

Species were sampled to maximize the number of independent C4 origins and their closest C3 relatives, while maintaining a balanced phylogenetic sampling as established in previous work (9). The species were incorporated in a previously published dataset based on three plastid markers (9), and the phylogenetic relationships between the species sampled for anatomy were extracted. This phylogenetic tree was used for comparative analyses. It was also used to test for the existence of C4 precursors, following a recently developed approach (33), which compares models that assume the existence of an unidentified precursor (precursor$_1$ and precursor$_2$ models) to several binary models. Transitions between C3 and C4 photosynthesis are not allowed and can only occur between C3 photosynthesis and a precursor state and then between the precursor state and C4 photosynthesis (33).

Cross-sections of the middle part of mature leaves were photographed and used to measure several areas and lengths that were averaged over multiple veins (fig. S1). C4 species were classified into those using the OS tissue (C3-Os) and those using the IS (C4-IS) for carbon reduction, based on the localization of starch production. The relative proportions of OS and IS tissues were calculated as $\%$OS = OS area/(OS area + M area) and $\%$IS = IS area/(IS area + M area), respectively. The best evolutionary model was determined for each anatomical variable, and the ancestral values of the anatomical traits were reconstructed on the phylogenetic tree. The effect of anatomical traits on C4-Os and C4-IS evolvability was tested with models that allow transitions only above (or below) a given value of the anatomical trait. These models were compared with the null models (transition rates independent from anatomical traits) through likelihood ratio tests. The methods are detailed in SI Materials and Methods.

**ACKNOWLEDGMENTS.** We thank Rosa Cerros, Russell Hall, Suay Jacobs, Simon Malcolm, and Steve Renvoize for their help in acquiring useful samples. This work was funded by Marie Curie International Outgoing Fellowship 252568 (to P.-A.C.), National Science Foundation (NSF) Division of Environmental Biology Grant 0920147 (to J.T.C.), Agence Nationale de la Recherche Grant 10LABX-41 (to G.B.), and NSF Division of Integrative Organismal Systems Grant 0843231 (to J.E.E.).

8. Grif R360
Supporting Information

Christin et al. 10.1073/pnas.1216777110

SI Materials and Methods

Phylogenetic Inference. A previously published 545-taxon dataset of the grasses based on the plastid markers rbcL, ndhF, and tmK-matK (1) was expanded and used for phylogenetic inference. For species sampled for anatomical cross-sections but not included in the published dataset, the markers ndhF and/or tmK-matK were either retrieved from GenBank when available or were newly sequenced from extracted genomic DNA with the method and primers described previously (1, 2). These new sequences were aligned to the dataset, excluding the regions that were too variable as described previously (1). The final dataset totaled 604 taxa and was used for phylogenetic inference as implemented in the software Bayesian Evolutionary Analysis by Sampling Trees (BEAST) (3).

The phylogenetic tree was inferred under a general time-reversible substitution model with a gamma-shape parameter and a proportion of invariants (GTR+G+1). Flagellaria indica (Flagellariaceae) was used to root the tree, following previous results (4). A relaxed molecular clock was implemented with rates that followed a log-normal distribution. No time constraint was used except for the crown of the BEP-PACMAD clade, which was modeled by a normal distribution with a mean of 51.2 and a SD of 6. The speciation pattern was set to follow a Yule process. The starting values and operators were optimized through repeated analyses. Two final analyses were run each for 20,000,000 generations. A tree was sampled every 5,000 generations after a burn-in period of 5,000,000, which was enough for the analysis to converge, as verified with the software TRACER (5). A consensus tree was then computed, and the tree was pruned to include only the species sampled for cross-sections using the package analyses of phylogenetics and evolution APE (6) in R. The phylogenetic measurements of Spartina alterniflora were assigned to its allopolyploid species Spartina anglica in the phylogeny, and those of Spartina obtusa were assigned to one of the representatives of this monophyletic genus. Two species, for which cross-sections have been measured, were not included in the phylogenetic reconstruction because of a lack of good-quality DNA. These species were used for the description of variables but were excluded from phylogeny-based analyses.

The phylogenetic tree was used to test for the existence of precursors, which might have evolved in some clades and allowed the evolution of C4 photosynthesis in its descendants. This recently developed approach takes a two-state character (C3 vs. C4) and models it as a three-state character (C3, precursor, C4), where the transition between C3 and C4 is done in two steps, from C3 to precursor and then from precursor to C4 (7). In the previous studies (8–10), the transition between C3 and C4 is done in two steps, from C3 to precursor and then from precursor to C4 (7). In the two-state model was compared with the precursor_1 model (identical rates for C3/precursor and precursor/C4 transitions) and the two-state model (different rates for C3-to-C4 and C4-to-C3 transitions) using Akaike information criteria.

Plant Material and Cross-Sections. Mature leaves were either sampled from plants grown in the greenhouse, collected in the wild, or from dried herbarium specimens. When possible, the second or third leaf below the inflorescence was used. Our sampling was supplemented with 30 slides made available from previous studies (8–10). Leaf blade segments from dried herbarium material were rehydrated in water and 10% (wt/wt) aerosil OT for 48 h. Most samples were stored in 100% (vol/vol) ethanol for at least 2 wk. Segments from the center of leaf blades were then embedded in resin (JB-4; Polysciences), following the manufacturer’s instructions. Five-micrometer thick cross-sections of the embedded leaf fragments were cut with a microtome and stained with saturated cresyl violet acetate (CVA). Some samples were fixed in formalin-pro-pionic acid-alcohol (FPA), embedded in paraffin, sectioned at 10 μm, and stained with a safranin O-orange G series (11) as described in (12). All slides were made permanent and are available on request.

Anatomical Measurements. All C3 grasses possess a double BS, with the outer layer derived from ground meristem to form a “parenchyma sheath,” and the internal layer derived from the vascular procambium to form a “mesmote sheath” (13). Many C4 grasses also possess these two BS layers, with one of them specialized in carbon reduction and usually referred to as “carbon reduction” or “Kranz” tissue (14). However, this Kranz tissue can correspond either to the OS or the IS of C3 grasses (13, 15). In addition, several C4 grasses possess only one sheath, in which all investigated species derives from procambium, and is, therefore, homologous to the IS (= “mesmote”) of C3 grasses (15). The terms “mesmote” and “Kranz” are, therefore, functionally oriented and are evolutionarily ambiguous. The two sheaths are consequently referred to as IS and OS throughout this manuscript. The definition of all anatomical characters measured in this study aimed at allowing comparison (through homology) among all of the considered taxa.

Photographs of the cross-sections were taken at a magnification of 20× using a Nikon Eclipse E600 compound light microscope (Nikon Instruments) linked to a Nikon DXM1200C digital camera. An area extending from the middle of a vascular bundle to the middle of a distant bundle was measured with ImageJ software (16). When possible, the median vascular bundle was not considered and the measured areas encompassed lateral bundles of different orders. On the selected section, the areas of M, OS, and vascular tissue (total area inside of the IS) were measured together with other characters (Fig. S1). The M was defined as all of the tissue between the epidermis and BS. Structural cells without photosynthetic potential, such as fibers and bulliform cells, were excluded. The OS was defined as the single layer of concentrically arranged cells directly outside the IS. If additional OS cells were present (e.g., BS extension), they were excluded (from both M and OS areas) for comparative purposes. Only cells that were visually differentiated from the surrounding M were considered, and incomplete OS were scored for several taxa. The IS was defined as the single layer of cells that surrounds the vascular tissue (xylem, phloem, and fibers together). In most cases, the IS was complete (i.e., formed a complete ring), but a few exceptions existed, resulting in the measurement of partial IS. When only one BS was present (C3 taxa only), this was considered as the IS, following previous observations in three independently evolved C4 taxa (15). It is, however, possible that some C3 lineages that have not been studied developmentally have a single BS that corresponds to the OS. The measured cross-sectional areas were used to calculate, for each leaf, the proportion of OS with M [%OS = OS area/(OS area + M area)] and the proportion of IS with M [%IS = IS area/(IS area + M area)]. The center of starch production was identified by the accumulation of chloroplasts, as observed on the cross-sections and described in previous works (8–10), and species were consequently classified as C4 using the OS (C4-OS) or C4 using the IS (C4-IS) as appropriate. Two species in our sampling are known to use C3 photosynthesis [also known as C3-C4 photosynthesis (17)].
based on the OS (in the genus *Steinchisma*). Because C₂ photosynthesis also represents a derived state over the ancestral C₃ trait, these two species were classified as C₂-OS.

The BSD, defined as the mean distance of M from the outer wall of one BS to the outer wall of an adjacent BS, was also measured on the same sections. In addition, the IVD was measured as the mean distance between centers of veins through the M. In addition, the number of M cells between two adjacent bundles and their longest diameters were measured for a minimum of 15 cells following the shortest path through M. The width of the OS and IS cells was measured for the two most-equatorial cells of each vein along the diameter of the corresponding vein. Leaf thickness was measured from upper epidermis to lower epidermis at the major lateral veins (veins accompanied by fibers and/or separated by bulliform cells). A second leaf thickness (thickness²) was measured from upper epidermis to lower epidermis at the thinnest point between two major veins. A ratio of thicknesses was computed as thickness² divided by thickness, which estimates whether the leaf is flat (ratio = 1) or thinner between veins than at veins (ratio < 1). The average distance between major veins was also measured (IVDm). All measurements were averaged over the analyzed area and are given in micrometers or square micrometers.

**Intraspecific Replicates.** To evaluate the intraspecific variability in anatomical traits, measurements were repeated on individuals belonging to the same species but grown in different conditions and/or that originated from different geographic origins (Dataset S1). Replicates were obtained for 15 species, including one outgroup, two C₄, nine C₃ PACMAD, and three C₃ BEP. All measured traits varied within species, which can be attributable to phenotypic plasticity and intraspecific genetic variation. The impact of this variation on the patterns observed in this study was evaluated by linear regressions. For each species, the sample with the largest measured total area was defined as the reference and the sample with the smallest measured area was defined as the duplicate. The $R^2$ of the linear regression (forcing the intercept to 0) of the duplicates on the references for the different traits ranged from 0.74 (for thickness²) to 0.98 (for OS width), except for the mean vein area ($R^2 = 0.59$). These results indicate that despite intraspecific variation, the trends are consistent among different samples. Consequently, only reference samples were included in comparative analyses.

**Comparative Analyses.** We used different phylogeny based methods to model the evolution of anatomical characters while correcting for historical factors. All comparative analyses were performed in R using the packages APE (6), GEIGER (18), OUCH (19) and CAPER (20). All variables were log-transformed except for the three ratios (%OS, %IS, and ratio of thicknesses). To differentiate taxonomic and photosynthetic effects, we modeled the variables separately first for the three major clades but excluding C₄ taxa (outgroups, BEP, and PACMAD) and then for all photosynthetic types but in PACMAD only (C₃ PACMAD, C₄-OS, and C₄-IS). The best evolutionary model was selected through hierarchical likelihood ratio tests between a Brownian motion model, an OU model C₃/C₄ with a two-parameter model, and the threshold for the change of probabilities was optimized from the data under maximum likelihood as implemented in the software BayesTraits (22). The model that assumes an increase of transition rates after a given value of an anatomical character can be compared with the model without branch transformation through a likelihood ratio test with one degree of freedom. To circumvent the issue of strong differences between C₃ and C₄ values, the models were optimized on a phylogeny that contained only C₃ taxa and C₃ species were typed as “sister to C₄-OS” or “sister to C₄-IS,” which was then used as a proxy for C₄ origins. Because C₃/C₄ transitions happened on branches separating C₃ lineages and their C₄ sister groups, asking whether a given anatomical trait increases the probability of becoming an actual C₄ group or sister to a C₄ group is equivalent. C₃ species not sister to C₃ lineages were given a score of 0, whereas the others were given a score of 1. The C₄-IS groups Andropogoneae and Anthephorinae are both sister to groups that encompass other C₄ lineages, as well as their respective C₃ sister groups (1). All C₃ species in these two groups were consequently given a score of 1 (sister to C₄-IS). The C₃ taxa sister to C₄-IS lineages nested within each of these groups were given a score of 2 to model additional transitions. The trait was modeled as a multistate character where transition rates q₀₁, q₁₂, q₂₁, q₀₂, q₂₀ = q₀₉ = 0, forcing the transitions to occur on branches connecting C₃ ancestors and C₄-OS descendants.

42(3):739–768.
11. Sharman BC (1943) Tannic acid and iron alum with safranin and orange G in studies of 
between Bouteloua aristidoides and B. (Chondrosium) eriopoda (Gramineae: 
anatomy of C3 and C4 grasses (Poaceae): Bundle sheath and mesophyll surface area 

Fig. S1. Representation of the measured areas and lengths. The measured characters are shown on a leaf section of the C₄-IS Alloteropsis semialata. (A) BSD (purple lines) and main areas (yellow, M; green, OS; red, IS; light blue, veins). (B) Other lengths (yellow, IVD; light blue, thickness; red, thickness2; purple, OS size; green, IS size; blue, M size).
Fig. S2. Distribution of trait values among clades and photosynthetic types. Boxes indicate the 25th and 75th percentiles, and whiskers indicate the extreme values still within 1.5 interquartile range of the upper and lower quartiles, respectively.
Fig. S3. Mapping of measured and reconstructed values of OS width on the phylogeny. The measured and inferred values of OS width are mapped on a calibrated phylogeny of the C3 grasses included in this study. The diameter of the dots is proportional to OS width values. The values above the threshold that promotes C4-OS evolution are in orange. Branches where the C3 to C4-OS transitions occurred are thicker.
Fig. S4. Mapping of measured and reconstructed values of %IS on the phylogeny. The measured and inferred values of %IS are mapped on a calibrated phylogeny of the C3 grasses included in this study. The diameter of the dots is proportional to %IS values. The values in the C4 range are indicated in red, and those outside the C4 range but above the threshold that promotes C4-IS evolution are in orange. Branches where the C3- to C4-IS transitions occurred are thicker.

Christin et al. www.pnas.org/cgi/content/short/1216777110
Fig. S5. Mapping of measured and reconstructed values of IS width on the phylogeny. The measured and inferred values of IS width are mapped on a calibrated phylogeny of the C₃ grasses included in this study. The diameter of the dots is proportional to IS width values. The values in the C₄ range are indicated in red, and those outside the C₃ range but above the threshold that promotes C₄-IS evolution are in orange. Branches where the C₃ to C₄-IS transitions occurred are thicker.
Fig. S6. Mapping of measured and reconstructed values of BSD on the phylogeny. The measured and inferred values of BSD are mapped on a calibrated phylogeny of the C3 grasses included in this study. The diameter of the dots is inversely proportional to BSD values. The values in the C4 range are indicated in red, and those outside the C4 range but below the threshold that promotes C4-OS evolution are in orange. Branches where the C3 to C4-OS transitions occurred are thicker.
Fig. S7. Distribution of trait linked to BSD among clades and photosynthetic types. The distribution of five variables is summarized by boxplots. Boxes indicate the 25th and 75th percentiles and whiskers the extreme values still within 1.5 interquartile range of the upper and lower quartiles, respectively. BSD, inter-BS distance; IVDm, distance between major veins. Number of M cells is between two adjacent BSs.

Fig. S8. Detail of a portion of Homolepis leaf. This picture shows several vascular bundles of the C3 Homolepis aturensis. The centripetal position of chloroplasts in the outer BS is usually characteristic of C₄ species.

Dataset S1. Sample details and anatomical measurements

For each species, the measured and extrapolated values are indicated. Phylogeny indicates whether the species was included in the phylogeny. The voucher accession is indicated with the herbarium where the voucher is deposited in parentheses. SisterC4.OS: if the species belongs to a clade sister to a C₄-OS group, its value is 1. SisterC4.IS: if the species belongs to a clade sister to a C₄-IS group, its value is 1 (2 for species sister to a C₄-IS group and nested in a clade sister to another C₄-IS group). Duplicate: the value is 0 if there was only one sample per species, 1 if the sample was considered as the reference, and 2 if it was considered as the replicate. area.bundle, total of OS+IS+vein; area.total, total measured area (M+OS+IS+vein); B&T, seeds acquired from B and T World Seeds (Aigues Vives, France); measured_width, total width (connecting the veins) of the measured area; nb.M, mean number of M cells between two adjacent bundles; nb.veins, number of veins in the section used for measurements; nb.veins.major, number of major veins in the section used for measurements; USDA, seeds acquired from the US Department of Agriculture, Agricultural Research Service (Griffin, GA).